

1. From simultaneity to concessivity (final part of the handout)

- Close tie-up with ‘simultaneity, temporal overlap, continuation’ as source: opposition to causality and preference;
- High number of markers, greatest cognitive complexity, at least minimal explicit coding of rhetorical relation (Kortmann 1997: 167)

- **dedicated marker**
- (20) a. John went for a walk, even though it was raining.
b. John went for a walk, in spite of the rain.
c. It was raining. Nevertheless, John went out for a walk.

- Syntactic category
- a. prepositions: *in spite of, despite, notwithstanding, regardless of...*
b. conjunctions: *although, though, even though, while, ...*
c. conjunctive adverbs: *still, yet, nevertheless, nonetheless, for all that, all the same, regardless, anyway...*

- context-dependent interpretation

- (21) It is not easy to find examples of social services that are of general social benefit and, at the same time, not costly.
- (22) We advised against buying the house. He did it anyway.
- (23) Poor as he is, he spends a lot of money on gambling.
- (24) After having treated me for a while like a notorious troublemaker, they became after a while very solicitous.
- (25)a. Si Michel Berger a vécu une histoire d’amour passionnelle avec France Gall, très peu de gens savent que l’artiste a aussi connu une belle idylle dans les bras d’une autre jeune femme.
b. Certain pays choisissent de réduire la durée d’isolement, mais en même temps ils acceptent probable ment une part du risque un peu plus importante.(Le Monde 11 septembre, 2020).
- (26) On both sides that passion carries with it an assumption that the choice matters... Yet at the same time, the choice presented to MPs belies that notion. (New Statesman, 31 October 1980)
- does a concessive interpretation require a minimal coding ?
- (27) We offered him a lot of money. (but/and) He was not interested.
- (28) He was sick. (but/and) He went to work.

Meaning:

- the traditional insights captured in a wide variety of descriptive labels:
- (29) {*concession/concessive, counterexpectation, surprise annoncée, remarkable co-occurrence, incausal, condition contrecarrée, human opposition to unfavorable circumstances...*}
- (Koenig, 1986, 1988; 1994)

Even though p, q; p all the same q

- (30) a. Even though it is raining, John went out for a walk.
b. **assertion:** p and q (It is raining. John went out for a walk.)
c. **background assumption: normally** [not (if p, q)] = **normally** [if p, not-q];

Cognitive basis:

Children know next to nothing about co-occurrence of situations. As we grow older, we learn more and more about such co-occurrences and restrictions on co-occurrence and may indicate our frustrated expectations in concessive constructions: Assertion of two propositions whose co-occurrence goes against a background based on our experience.

How to express relevant cooccurrence restriction:

The background assumption allows exceptions: captured by adverb *normally*; alternative proposed by Winter (1994): existential quantification over the antecedent: $\exists p (p \rightarrow q)$
Both formulations are vague and thus perhaps capture the vagueness of concessive background assumptions approximately:

An alternative analysis proposed by **Gast (2019)**, who explicates the meaning of concessivity and the basic intuition of incompatibility in terms of probability.

- (31)a. Even though he worked very hard, John failed the exam. (even though p, nonetheless q)
b. John worked very hard and John failed the exam. (p & q) (**assertion**)
c. ‘one works very hard’ and ‘one passes (i.e. does not fail) the exam’ is more probable than ‘one works very hard’ and ‘one fails the exam’ (**projective content; background assumption**)
d. Even though p, (nevertheless) q.
e. p’ & not-q’ > (= ‘is more probable than’) p & q
- simple, compositional, based on conditionals and ‘probability’, episodic event > non-episodic generalization (subjective –general)

List of open questions:

Do all concessive markers have the same meaning?

What is the adequate terminology for the two propositions combined in concessive constructions? (based on meaning, rather than form: noncontroversial concession vs. major conflicting claim)

- Wide variety of source domains for concessive markers, roughly classifiable into 4 or five types, though overlapping in their notional content
- (a) Remarkable: simultaneity, continuation, co-occurrence/concomitance
(b) Background assumption of implicational connection, correlation: general incompatibility of situations: conditionals, concessive conditionals
(c) Negation of cause for change;
(d) Negation of other influence (attitudes of agents)
- (i) **Simultaneity/temporal continuation/concomitance** as prominent sources in the development of concessive markers (common denominator: noteworthy cooccurrence)

(Engl. *still, yet, all the same, just the same; withall, while*; Fr. *en même temps, quand même, cependant, encore que*; German *dennoch, gleichzeitig*; Span. *aunque, con todo*; Lat. *cum*)

(32) [Re: emotional intimacy in a relationship] You share your fears and trust that they will be a safety net for you to help you overcome any obstacles. This applies to both spouses.

At the same time, you must respect that your spouse still needs privacy in order to feel balanced. (Traugott, 2022) (2012 *What I need in order to heal* [COCA])

(33) Nous n’accepterons jamais une société de l’opacité ou de la complaisance, et en même temps, nous ne voulons pas non plus d’une société de l’inquisition.

(34) Si c'est à l'ancienne ministre du Travail de composer le prochain gouvernement, c'est bien le chef de l'État qui garde la main. Ce qui se joue en coulisses, c'est l'équilibre entre la droite et la gauche, **le fameux "en même temps"** cher au chef de l'État réélu.

(ii) Conditionals

Irrelevance of conditional circumstances for major claim; concessive/irrelevance conditionals as source;

(Engl. *even if, even so, though*; Germ. *wenn auch, obgleich*; Fr. *même si*)

(35)a. Si Michel Berger a vécu une histoire d’amour passionnelle avec France Gall, très peu de gens savent que l’artiste a aussi connu une belle idylle dans les bras d’une autre jeune femme.

b. Si elles n'ont pas réussi à gagner sur le terrain, les joueuses de Corinne Diacre ont cependant réussi à rassembler un grand nombre de téléspectateurs.

c. Même si les modèles sont similaires, il existe un grand écart de prix.

d. He may be a professor, but he is still very ignorant.

(iii) Negation of cause for change

(Engl. *nevertheless, none the worse for, not...for all that...notwithstanding, regardless*; Germ. *unbeschadet*, Fr. *n’empêche pas, sans pour autant,*) (Cat. *per hoc* ‘causal’ > *però* ‘concessive/adversative’; *per hoc* > *per això* ‘causal’ > *per (ai)xò*) (cf. Hansen, 2018)

(36) Les résolutions de l’ONU interdisent à la Corée du Nord, frappée par de lourdes sanctions internationales pour ses programmes nucléaires et d’armement, de procéder à des essais de missiles balistiques. Sanctions qui n’ont pas empêché Pyongyang à réaliser une dizaine de tests de ce type depuis le début de l’année.

(37)a. The house is no less comfortable because it dispenses with air-conditioning.

b. The house is no less comfortable, although it dispenses with air-conditioning.

(38) John can be very selfish, but he is not unpleasant to work with for all that.

(iv) Attitudes, negative reactions of agents to incompatibility

(Engl. *in spite of, despite, regardless*; FR. *en dépit de, au mépris de, malgré*; Span. *a pesar de*; Du *ondanks* ‘thoughtlessness > ingratitude’, in *weerwil van* ‘against one’s will’; Fin. *huolimatta* ‘careless, heedless, negligent’), Mandarin *不怕 bùpà* ‘no fear’ > ‘although’

(39) Maar ondanks onze inspanningen voelde de dokter zich eenzaam.

‘But in spite of our efforts the doctor felt lonely.’

Basis for interpretative enrichment:

simultaneity/concomitance are highly unexpected, remarkable, relevant; there is a vast number of situations happening simultaneously, overlapping in time and cooccurring. But only a small number of those are remarkable, relevant to be mentioned since they go against general principles, observations, assumptions, expectations concerning co-occurrence and concomitance.

Generalization:

Simultaneity – continuation – negation of change – sameness – unconditionality – attitudes of resignation/indifference

2. Summary and conclusion

- Discussion of recent work on semantic change in connection with a specific domain:
Local and temporal source for textual cohesion
- Arguments for more detailed analyses of sources and targets, rather attaching labels;
exploitation of full spectrum of approaches
- Arguments for focusing on changes of more general patterns rather isolated instances
(cf. Juvonen, Päivi & Maria Koptjevskaja-Tamm, 2016)
- Fruitful interaction between fine-grained contrastive analysis and more general
typological studies
- Principles underlying coherence and, more generally bridging contexts.
- Primarily use of data from European languages in the hope of obtaining data from your
languages

3. References

- Abraham, Werner. 1976. Die Rolle von Trugschlüssen in der Diachronie von Satzkonnectoren. In Pohl, Hans Dieter & Nikolai Salnikov. 1976. *Opuscula Slavica et Linguistica*. Festschrift für Alexander Issatschenko. Klagenfurt: Heyn.
- Asr, F.T. & Demberg, V. (2012). Implicitness of discourse relations. In *Proceedings COLING 2012* (2669-2684): COLING.
- Blumenthat-Dramé, Alice. 2021. The Online Processing of Causal and Concessive Relations: Comparing Native Speakers of English and German. *Discourse Processes*. DOI: 10.1080/0163853X.2020.1855693
- Bréal, Michel (1897, ³1904). *Essai de Sémantique*. Paris : Hachette.
- Couper-Kuhlen, Elizabeth & Bewrnd Kortmann. 2000. *Cause, Condition, Concession, Contrast. Cognitive and Discourse Perspectives*. Berlin : Mouton de Gruyter.
- Cruse, Alan (1986). *Lexical Semantics*. Cambridge: CUP.
- Dietrich, Thomas & Donna Jo Napoli. 1982. Comparative rather. *Journal of Linguistics* 18. 137-165.
- Gast, Volker (2019). “A corpus-based comparative study of concessive connectives in English, German and Spanish: The distribution of *although*, *obwohl* and *aunque* in the Europarl corpus“. In Loureda, O., I. Recio Fernandez, L. Nadal and A. Cruz (eds.), *Empirical Studies of the Construction of Discourse*. Amsterdam: Benjamins.
- Georgacopoulos, Thanasis. 2019. *Semantic Maps*. Oxford Bibliographies.
- Hansen, Maj-Britt Mosegaard. 2018. Cyclic phenomena in the evolution of pragmatic markers. Examples from Romance. In Salvador Pons Bordería & Oscar Loureda

- Lamas, eds. *Beyond Grammaticalization and Discourse Markers New Issues in the Study of Language Change*. Leiden: Brill, 51-77.
- Hansen, Maj-Britt Mosegaard. 2020. *De ainz à plutôt: Un cycle de prgmaticalization*. In Olga Inkova ed. *Autour de la reformulation*. Genève: Droz.
- Haspelmath, Martin (2003). The geometry of grammatical meaning: Semantic maps and crosslinguistic comparison. In: M. Tomasello (ed.), *The New Psychology of Language*, Vol. II: Cognitive and functional approaches to language structure, 211-242. Mahwah, NJ: Erlbaum
- Heine, Bernd & Kuteva, Tanja. (2002). *World Lexicon of Grammaticalization*. Cambridge: CUP.
- Juvonen, Päivi & Maria Koptjevskaja-Tamm. 2016. *The Lexical Typology of Semantic Shifts*. Berlin: De Gruyter.
- Koenig, Ekkehard. 1974. The semantic structure of time prepositions in English. *LFoundations of Language* 11.551-563.
- Koenig, Ekkehard. 1988. Concessive connectives and concessive sentences. Crosslinguistic regularities and pragmatic principles. In Hawkins, John, ed. *Explaining Language Universals*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 145-166.
- Koenig, Ekkehard. 1991. Concessive relations as the dual of causal relations. In Zaefferer, Dietmar. ed. *Semantic Universals and Universal Semantics*. Berlin 6 New York: Foris.
- Koenig, Ekkehard. 2020. Concessive markers and concessive meanings: Taking stock of what we know and do not know.
- Koenig, Ekkehard & Traugott, Elizabeth. 1988. Pragmatic strengthening and semantic change: The conventionalizing of conversational implicatures. In Hüllen, Werner & Rainer Schulze (eds.) *Understanding the Lexicon*. Tübingen: Niemeyer.
- Koenig, Ekkehard & Traugott, Elizabeth (1991). The semantics-pragmatics of grammaticalization revisited. In Traugott & Bernd Heine, eds. *Approaches to Grammaticalization I*. Amsterdam: Benjamins, 189-218.
- Kortmann, B. 1997. *Adverbial subordination: A typology and history of adverbial subordinators based on European languages*. Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter.
- Latos, Agnieszka. 2009. La relazione concessiva fattuale in italiano e polacco. Il caso della codifica adeguata. *Studi Italiani di Linguistica Teorica e Applicata*, 38. 3
- Le Draoulec, Anne. 2021. *Pendant ce temps*, du temporel à l’adversatif. Séminaire Lattice, 23 novembre 2021.
- Löbner, Sebastian. 2011. Dual oppositions in lexical meaning. In C. Maienborn, K. von Heusinger & P. Portner (eds.), *Semantics. an international handbook of natural language meaning (HSK)*, vol. 1, 479–506. Berlin, New York: Mouton de Gruyter.
- Lyons, John (1963). *Structural Semantics*. Cambridge: CUP.
- Michaelis, Laura. 2007. Aspect selectors, scales and contextional operators: An analysis of *by* temporal adjuncts. In Cambor-Portilla, M. & Leow, R. *GURT 2007*. Washington DC: Georgetown University Press.
- Paul, Herrmann (1880, ⁵1920). *Prinzipien der Sprachgeschichte*. Halle: Niemeyer.
- Prandi, M. 2004. *The Building Blocks of Meaning*. Amsterdam: Benjamins.
- Sanders, T.J.M. (2005). Coherence, causality and cognitive complexity in discourse. In: M. Aurnague, M. Bras, A. Le Draoulec & L. Vieu (eds.), *Proceedings/Acts SEM 05, First International Symposium on the exploration and modeling of meaning*, 105-114.
- Sanders, T. J. M., & Noordman, L. G. M. (2000). The role of coherence relations and their linguistic markers in text processing. *Discourse Processes*, 29(1), 37–60.
https://doi.org/10.1207/S15326950dp2901_3
- Swart, Henriette de, Jos Tellings & Bernhard Wälchli. 2022. *Not...until* across European languages: A parallel corpus study. *Languages* 7.

- Sweetser, E. (1991). *From etymology to pragmatics: Metaphorical and cultural aspects of semantic structure*. Cambridge University Press.
- Thompson, Sandra, Annear. 1972. *Instead of and rather than* clauses in English. *Journal of Linguistics* 8.237-249.
- Traugott, Elizabeth. 1978. On the expression of spatio-temporal relations in language. In Greenberg, Joseph, Charles Ferguson and Edith Moravcsic, eds. *Universals in Human Language*, vol. 3: Word Structure. Stanford: Stanford University Press
- Traugott, Elizabeth Closs. 2020. Expressions of stance-to-text: Discourse management markers as stance markers. In Gunther Kaltenböck, María José López-Couso and Belén Méndez-Naya, eds., *Investigating Stance Constructions in English: Synchrony and Diachrony*, Special issue *Language Sciences*. Article 101329.
- Traugott, Elizabeth (2022). *Just the same they call it embezzlement*: On concessive markers with *same*. To appear.
- Ullmann, Stephen (1951, ³1967). *The Principles of Semantics*. Glasgow/Oxford.
- Winter, Yoad & Mori, R. 1994. Contrast and implication in Natural Languages. *Journal of Semantics* 11: 365-406.